

Emerging Toxic Torts

Box 62090 • King of Prussia, PA 19406-0230 • (610) 768-7800 • fax (610) 962-4991

Mold Contamination:

EXCLUSIVE EDITION

Toxic Tort and Property Claims

Mealey's Coverage
1995 - 2000

ort
al
Special Report

Introduction

According to the Environmental Protection Agency's Indoor Air Quality Home Page, Americans spend 75% to 90% of their time indoors, increasingly in sealed environments, exposed to a host of pollutants. Among these are the pollutants associated with mold contamination. Recent studies also suggest that indoor air quality may be deeply implicated in the growing incidence and severity of asthma and other respiratory diseases and allergies. *Mealey's Emerging Toxic Torts* has covered developments and litigation in this area for more than 5 years, and Mealey Publications is pleased to present this Special Report based on its archive materials.

Mealey's is proud as well of the quality and usefulness of the commentary articles written for its publications by outside experts, and believe that they deserve a wide circulation. We are glad to reprint here a penetrating article by Alexander Robertson IV, managing partner of Knopfler & Robertson. Mr. Robertson's commentary originally appeared in *Mealey's Emerging Toxic Torts* and *Mealey's Litigation Report: Construction Defects*, but we reprint here the expanded version with appendix as it was presented at Mealey's Construction Defect Litigation Conference in December 1999.

The stories below follow the order in which they appear in the Case List, and referenced documents remain available from the Mealey's archive (now numbering some 35,000 documents).

Please let us know of developments in your own work and litigation. We welcome your submissions and news, and would be glad to hear your suggestions for future Special Reports.

Bill G. Lowe, editor, *Mealey's Emerging Toxic Torts*

Francis X. Mooney, research specialist, compilation editor.

Table of Contents

Commentary: Microbiological Contamination Litigation <i>Alexander Robertson analyzes 'The Mold Monster'</i>	4
Knopfler and Robertson Micro-Organism Guide	20
Institute of Medicine Study Finds Fungi, Dust Contribute to Asthma <i>Indoor environments typically include exposures to potentially problematic agents</i>	28
Homeowner Seeks Coverage for Sick Building Claims <i>Allege Prudential failed to pay for problems caused by molds, fungi in their home</i>	29
Proposed Class Action Against Illinois School Claims Sick Building Conditions <i>Complaint seeks more than \$67 million for injuries allegedly caused by mold contamination</i>	30
Illinois Court Allows Injunctive Relief Claim in Sick Building Action <i>At issue were claims that irreparable harm would occur if school building stayed open</i>	31
Farmers Subsidiary Sued Over Toxic Mold Growth Caused By Unrepaired Leak <i>Couple seeks \$25 million in compensatory damages, \$75 million in exemplary damages</i>	34
Coverage Exists For Damage Caused By Mold From Basement Marijuana Cultivation <i>Appellate court holds that tenants' acts constituted vandalism; home's owner covered</i>	36
Sick Building Claims Dismissed Against Museum, Remain Against Trustees <i>Museum workers allege exposure to toxic substances in the ventilation system</i>	38
Published Report: SBS Settlement in Florida <i>Courthouse workers claim to have suffered from the effects of sick building syndrome</i>	39
\$11.55 Million Awarded in Construction Defects, Sick Building Case <i>County experts had found toxic molds present in the building, see construction defects</i>	39
Martin County Award Reduced for Settlements; Interest Awarded <i>County had alleged that construction defects fostered toxic molds and mildew</i>	42
\$14 Million Judgment Affirmed in Martin County Sick Building Case <i>Court turns aside defense arguments on insufficient evidence of breach of contract and damages</i>	44
Construction Manager Seeks Stay of \$14 Million Award in Martin County Case <i>Three sureties join construction company in motion to stay mandate</i>	46
Motion To Stay Mandate of \$14 Million Judgment Denied in Martin County Case <i>County had alleged two evacuated buildings suffered from construction defects</i>	47
Construction Manager Seeks Fla. Supreme Court Review of \$14 Million Judgment <i>Argues direct conflict among trial courts on calculation of damages and interest</i>	49

Florida High Court Denies Review of Martin County Verdict; \$17.3 Million Judgment Paid <i>Declines to hear appeal in sick building/construction defects case</i>	50
New York Renters Seek Compensation From Apartment Owner's Carrier <i>At issue are claims that exposure to toxic mold and fungus caused personal injuries</i>	52
California Woman Sues Apartment Owner, Alleging Personal Injury And Death <i>Apartment complex owner allegedly allowed toxic mold, fungi to grow within units</i>	53
Apartment Workers Allege Mold, Fungus Exposure Caused Personal Injuries <i>Claim project used untrained workers with no protective equipment</i>	54
Election Of Remedies Bars Arkansas Teacher's Tort Claim For Building Illness <i>Court relies on claimant's decision to accept workers' comp for mold exposure</i>	56
Mold, Fungi Clause Not Applicable To Loss From Leaking Roof <i>Texas appeals court affirms finding of coverage</i>	58
Florida Court Finds Claim That Mold Contamination Caused Injury Time-Barred <i>Court rejects personal injury claims because injuries were associated with mold in 1993</i>	60
Calif. Judge Sues County For Injuries Caused By Mold, Fungus Exposure <i>Complaint alleges faulty HVAC system caused hazardous contaminant colonization</i>	61
No Evidence That Bad Air Caused Injury, New Jersey Holds in Unpublished Opinion <i>Court upholds summary judgment in favor of HVAC contractor</i>	63
Proposed Class Action Claiming Injuries from Mold Filed in Canadian Court <i>Suit filed on behalf of school children seeks approximately \$2 billion in damages</i>	66
Condo Association Sues For Construction Defects, Toxic Mold Growth <i>Alleges construction defects led to water intrusion and microbiological contamination</i>	67
New York Building Owners Face \$8 Billion in Claims For Mold, Fungi Contamination <i>125 new lawsuits filed, claiming mold contamination caused personal injury, property damage</i>	68
Texas Court Says Claim Time-Barred; Action Accrued During Air Conditioning Repair <i>Action for injuries from mold accrued during air conditioning repair</i>	69
Summary Judgment On Pollution Exclusion Was Only Partial <i>Ruling not final because it failed to consider other defenses raised by an insurer</i>	71
\$818,390 Awarded On Apartment Residents Mold Contamination Claims <i>Plaintiffs alleged pervasive microbial contamination from various water problems</i>	73
Movers Immune From State Law Claims For Mold <i>Suit in Arizona federal court alleges company delivered goods in mold-covered boxes</i>	75
West Virginia School Board Reaches Settlement On Sick Building Complaints <i>14 plaintiffs included K-8 teachers, staff members, students and parents of students</i>	77

MOLD CONTAMINATION — CASE LIST

N.J. Super.	<u>Bryan and Aspen Allen v. Prudential Property</u>	
	Complaint	25-980806-102
Ill. Cir.	<u>Andrejevic v. Board of Education</u>	
	Complaint	15-990709-101
	Motion to dismiss preliminary injunction claim	15-000407-010
	Plaintiffs motion on injunctive relief	15-000407-011
	Order on injunctive relief claim	15-000407-013
	Amended complaint	15-000407-012
Texas Dist.	<u>Ballard v. Fire Insurance Exchange</u>	
	Complaint	07-990803-107
Wash. App.	<u>Bethany Bowers v. Farmers Insurance Exchange</u>	
	Opinion on coverage	03-000208-011
N.Y. Sup.	<u>Carr v. 583-587 Broadway Associates</u>	
	Sick building claims dismissed	
Fla. Cir.	<u>Martin County, Fla. v. Frank J. Rooney, Inc., n/k/a</u>	
	Centex-Rooney Construction Co., Inc.	
Fla. App.	<u>Centex-Rooney Construction v. Martin County, FL</u>	
	Opinion affirming judgment	15-980116-103
	Motions and rehearing order	25-980402-004
Fla. Sup.	<u>Centex-Rooney Construction v. Martin County, FL</u>	
	Petition	25-980618-008
	Respondent's brief	25-980618-009
	Motion on attorney's fees	25-980618-010
N.Y. Sup.	<u>Davis v. Zurich American Insurance Group</u>	
	Complaint	15-000310-109
L.A. Super.	<u>Fickett v. Davis Management Corporation</u>	
	Complaint	09-000217-101
Calif. Super.	<u>Forbes v. Forest City Enterprises</u>	
	Complaint	15-991006-009
Ark. Sup.	<u>Carolyn Gourley v. Crossett Public Schools</u>	
	Opinion barring tort claim.....	15-980522-104
Texas App.	<u>Home Insurance Co. v. McClain</u>	
	Opinion on exclusion	03-000214-011
Fla. App.	<u>Kolnick v. Fountainview Association</u>	
	Opinion barring claim	15-990723-013
Calif. Super.	<u>Krant v. County of Tulare</u>	15-000407-102
N.J. Super.	<u>Kuehm v. Hearnen Air Conditioning</u>	15-950915-106
	Opinion upholding summary judgment for def.	
Ont. Super.	<u>MacDonald v. Dufferin-Peel Catholic District School Board</u>	
	Complaint	15-990804-110

Calif. Super.	<u>McCulloch Townhomes v. USC Real Estate Development</u> Complaint	15-991221-104
N.Y. Sup.	<u>Munoz v. Henry Phipps Plaza South</u> Complaint	15-990625-103
Texas App.	<u>Palmer v. Sears Roebuck & Co.</u> Opinion barring injury claim	15-980615-102
11th Cir.	<u>Stillman v. Travelers Insurance Co.</u> Opinion on summary judgment	15-960712-020
Del. Super.	<u>Stroot v. New Haverford Partnership</u> Original verdict form	15-990625-110
D. Ariz.	<u>Tayloe v. Kachina Moving & Storage</u> Opinion on state law claims	15-981026-008
W.Va. Cir.	<u>Tenney v. Mineral County Board of Education</u> Administrative Law Judge decision	15-960809-006